November 13th, 2015: Paris
Islamic State (ISIS) Militants
Conduct Complex Terror Attack

- Coordinated attacks at seven different locations
- Three distinct areas of attack:
  1) Stade de France
  2) Cafés/streets near theater
  3) Bataclan theater
- Weapons: gunfire and explosives
- 130 killed, over 350 injured
Stade de France

Significant potential impact but failed in execution*

Strategy: Drive panicked spectators towards bombers

9:20pm: First bomber detonates outside stadium after attempted (ticketed) entry—security detects vest

9:30pm: Second bomber detonates outside stadium near another gate

9:53pm: Third bomber detonates away from stadium opposite second bomber

*Total fatalities (other than suicide bombers): 1
Stade de France: Devastation Averted

Shelter in place was key to mitigation of deadlier attack

- French President Francois Hollande in attendance
- Decision made to continue game and keep crowd in stadium
- Quietly put stadium on lockdown before halftime—prior to third suicide bomber detonation
- Result: Terrorists failed to gain desired bloodshed and media coverage
Increased carnage and chaos between main events

- **9:25 pm**: Gunmen hit two restaurants on either side of street; 15 dead
- **9:32 pm**: Gunmen shoot at café; 5 dead
- **9:36 pm**: Gunmen shoot up bar; 19 dead
- **9:40 pm**: Suicide bomber detonates at café; 0 dead
- **9:40 pm**: Gunmen arrive at and enter Bataclan Theater
Bataclan Theater

9:40 pm: Three gunmen with suicide belts enter theater and open fire on crowded American rock concert
- Gather survivors as “hostages”
- Three hour siege begins

12:20 am: Police storm theater
- 1 attacker killed by police
- 2 attackers detonate suicide vests
- 89 dead
Key Takeaways

1) Complex attack modality
2) Doomed captives – not “Hostages”
3) Suicide bomber as secondary device
4) Potential role of fire and smoke
5) Coordinated medical response
Complex Attack Modality

The new “spectacular” standard – now conducted in the West

Attacks are well-planned to maximize bloodshed and terror

- Coordinated attacks
  - Can involve multiple teams of attackers
  - Attacks at multiple locations
  - Attacks are timed to overwhelm resources

- Hybrid attacks
  - Several weapon types/attack types combined
  - Gunfire, explosives, suicide bombing, fire and smoke, etc.
“Paris-style” = “Mumbai-style”

Tactics were similar to the 2008 Mumbai attacks

Mumbai 2008
- **Target Selection:** Initial crowded venue, street-based shooting/grenades, final standoff venue
- Fedayeen*/Suicide operatives: 10 working in small teams and regrouping for finale
- Doomed “hostages”: Jewish center and hotels
- Fire & Smoke as a Weapon: Intentional burning of Taj Hotel

Paris 2015
- **Target Selection:** stadium, street, final standoff venue
- Fedayeen*/Suicide operatives: 8 in teams, then regroup
- Doomed “hostages”: Bataclan
- Fire and smoke not used as a weapon

*Fedayeen* (Arabic: فدائیين fidāʿīyīn, "those who sacrifice themselves")

1. Derives from the word فداء fidā’, which means redemption. Literally, someone who redeems himself by risking or sacrificing his life.
Doomed Captives - Not “Hostages”

**Hostage**

*noun* hostage \ˈhäs-tij\: a person who is captured by someone who demands that certain things be done before the captured person is freed.

- Media reported 60-100 hostages at the Bataclan
- No demands were made
  - A true hostage situation would have involved demands
- In reality, there were no “hostages” – only “doomed captives” whose only hope for survival hinged on escape or rescue
- Captives used to prolong attack, maximizing media coverage

*Attackers planned to kill captives from the start*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Differing “Hostage” Tactics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Barricade Hostages Sieges</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hostages are held with clear demands made</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Groups try to instill fear, while attracting attention and striving for legitimacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Less prominent role due to evolving goals of extremist groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Examples:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Moscow theater (2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Beslan school (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“Doomed Captives” Sieges</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Captives are held with sole intent of execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increasingly seen in extremist attacks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Goal is to prolong incident, not have demands met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Longer attacks = more media attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Examples:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Paris (2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mumbai (2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Suicide Bomber as Secondary Device

*Each attacker wore an explosive suicide belt.*

*Many detonated the belt, becoming a secondary device.*

Suicide bomber ensures optimal timing for attacker

- Target egress points for crowds
- Target arriving first responders

Used in two different ways in Paris

1) Stade de France
   - Targeted fleeing crowds (and responders)
2) Bataclan Theater
   - Targeted first responders

Photo: crowds leaving 2014 Super Bowl in NJ
Secondary Devices – Stade de France

Targeted fleeing crowds

- 1st bomber intended to detonate inside stadium
  - Would have created a frenzied evacuation
- 2nd and 3rd bombers intended to be secondary devices
  - 2nd explosion was 10 min later, 3rd explosion was 23 min later
  - Likely target = fleeing crowds at egress points
  - Also a target = first responders arriving at scene
    - Responders would have arrived before secondary blasts

Prior Incident: Soccer stadium bomb in Iraq (2010)
- At end of game, attackers drove a truck bomb onto the field and detonated it
- Several minutes later, two suicide bombers exploded at exits, targeting fleeing crowd
- Al Qaeda in Iraq was responsible – the group later became ISIS
Secondary Devices – Bataclan Theater

Targeted first responders

- Police storm theater, surviving 2 attackers detonate suicide belts
  - Target = first responders
  - Also sought to maximize carnage
  - No significant secondary effects of explosion
    - Structural collapse, structural fire were possible

Prior Incident: School attack in Russia (2004)

- Islamist Chechen rebels took hostages at elementary school
- Hostages kept in auditorium rigged with explosives
- When police stormed building, explosives detonated
- Explosions caused fire, led to collapse of auditorium roof
- Over 150 hostages killed in fire/collapse

Photo: Memorial at Beslan school
Potential Role of Fire and Smoke

*If employed as in Mumbai, fire and smoke as a weapon (FSW) would have greatly complicated the response scenario*

Theater attack would have been greatly affected by fire

- Detonated explosives could have caused fire and/or collapse
- Possible scenario: burning building with hundreds trapped inside

Major concerns for FD operations

- Time sensitive life threat
- Possible “Warm Zone” operations
  - Victim removal/medical care
  - Firefighting operations

Prior incident: Westgate Shopping Mall attack in Kenya (2013)

- Terrorist gunman attacked mall, killing dozens and trapping de facto “hostages”
- During standoff, military counteroffensive sparked fire, trapping remaining occupants inside
Coordinated Medical Response

*Successful response due to hospital-responder coordination*

**Keys to success in Paris response = Preplanning and Drills**

“White Plan” activation for crisis response at area hospitals.
- Recalled staff and reallocated resources
- Coordinated response between hospitals
- Result: Hospitals had surge capacity

**Frequent active shooter drills**
- Responders and hospitals drilled frequently
- There was a drill on the morning of the attack
- Drills prepared for a multi-location attack
- Responders did not over-commit to 1st incident
- Held resources in reserve

Photo: Recent FDNY/NYPD active shooter drill
It can happen here: San Bernardino Terror Attack

- Active shooter attack in San Berndino, CA
- 14 people killed at a soft target (Christmas party)
- Weapons: gunfire and explosives (not detonated)
- Attackers were self-radicalized Islamic extremists
- Not a suicide attack – terrorists left scene

Responders were faced with multiple victims and an active terrorist attack