Governance Working Group

Group Chairs: Jerry Hyman,

Dale Erickson &

Dr. Michael Baranick

Rapporteur: John Applebaugh

Governance Overview

1. Corruption and Information Operations in Afghanistan

    ■ 15 Minute Presentation/15 Minute Q&A: Ms. Leah Werchick – Senior Advisor, USAID/Office of Transition Initiatives

    ■ 30 Minute Discussion

2. Key Questions

    ■ 30 Minute General Overview of MG Flynn's Questions

    ■ MG Flynn's Questions; Ex: How does local population perceive/relate to local army, police versus the insurgency?

    ▫ What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

    ▫ What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

    ▫ What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

    ▫ What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

    ▫ How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

Governance Terms of Reference

What is 'governance' ?

- UN ESCAP: " *the **process** of decision-making and the **process** by which decisions are implemented (or not implemented"*

- The World Bank defines governance as
  *the **exercise of political authority** and the use of institutional resources to manage society's problems and affairs.*

- The Worldwide Governance Indicators project of the World Bank defines governance as
  *The **traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised**. This considers the process by which governments are selected, monitored and replaced; the capacity of the government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies and the respect of citizens and the state of the institutions that govern economic and social interactions among them.*

- An alternate definition sees governance as
  *the **use of institutions, structures of authority** and even collaboration to allocate resources and coordinate or control activity in society or the economy.*

- According to the United Nations Development Programme's Regional Project on Local Governance for Latin America:
  Governance has been defined as the ***rules of the political system*** to solve conflicts between actors and adopt decision (legality). It has also been used to describe the "proper functioning of institutions and their acceptance by the public" (legitimacy). And it has been used to invoke the efficacy of government and the achievement of consensus by democratic means (participation).

Governance
Descriptive Framework

- *The collective `**process** of decision-making and the **process** by which decisions are implemented (or not implemented"*

- *Governance analysis includes three components:*
  - *Process*
  - *Participation*
  - *Accountability*

Governance Framework
Considerations

- Traditional/customary governance processes gutted by decades of war

- At local (village) level, need for governances arises from collective issues over:
  - 1) Security 2) Civil justice (rule of law)
  - Less emphasis on 'delivery of hard services'

- Stratified authority basis at local level:
  - 1) Tribal consensus (not elected), 2) Religious, 3) Patronage (wealth), 4) Strongmen (militia leadership)
  - No nation-wide standard; authority base composition varies by region
  - 'Tragedy of the commons' – distribution of collectively owned resources

- Extension of Central government reach (i.e. services) is a new venture.
  - Historical approach- central government selection of intermediary (from the existing to represent the village to the government (malik)
  - New processes – e.g. emergent role of the Community Development Council (CDC) and community councils

Governance / Corruption

▣ <u>#6:</u> What are components of "political legitimacy" for the local population?

▣ <u>#9 & 10:</u> How much does corruption impact perceptions of local, provincial, and central governance in Kabul? How does government corruption impact the Afghan population?

▣ <u>#50:</u> Is there a correlation between perceptions of governance and support for the insurgency?

#6: What are components of "political legitimacy" for the local population?

- Who are the formal leaders / leadership organizations? From what source do they draw authority? Who are the informal leaders?

- Measures: Are leaders present identifiable, do they exist? What is their affiliation?

- Impediments: Village granularity difficult to achieve and relevant?

- Data sources –Triangulation for false positives
  - Ask District leaders, Provincial
  - Ask police
  - Bottom up-Balance against Afghan population perceptions – Corruption impact/who do they go to for adjudication
  - Coalition
    - District Assessments
    - CIDNE, UK databases (RC-S)
    - IDC

Key Questions – Governance Information Operations

- #3: What drives popular support/ tolerance for the insurgency vs. the government?

- #7: What is popular perception of effectiveness/intent of local/national governing officials?

- #17: What services do the insurgents provide that the Afghan government/ISAF have been unable to deliver?

#3: What drives popular support/ tolerance for the insurgency vs. the government?

- Measures – Distinction between active / passive support and between
    - Disenfranchisement from GIRoA resources (development, jobs, land) & power
        - Perceived inequities
    - Number of villages with QST (officials) present
        - Nature of the enemy – integral to society & not monolithic
    - Perception that support for Taliban improves economic or social opportunity?
        - Generational conflict
    - GIRoA perceived as predatory?
    - Metrics of fear – how do we measure fear?
        - Number of leadership who stay overnight in governed area
        - How many bodies?
        - Number of reports and relationships of people reporting disputes to ANP
        - Number of local community meetings held & enforceability of community decisions
        - Population movement – displaced persons

#3: What drives popular support/ tolerance for the insurgency vs. the government?

Means:

- Population survey
    - TCAPF
    - Poll
    - Trusted agent

- Knowledge management issue
    - We have the data – how do you make tacit, qualitative knowledge explicit for the commander

Key Questions - Governance

- #4: How does population accept/see governance? What is historic response to governance?

- #20: How would the population design their local, district, provincial and national government if given the opportunity?

- #39: What would be the accepted (active) role of the government in business development?

#4: How does population accept/see governance?
What is historic response to governance?

- **Measures:**
  - **Acceptance of current & emergent governance processes (e.g. CDC) – Is governance working?**
- **Means:**
  - Are decisions made?
  - Who exerts control over the process?
    - Tracked over time - Proportion of decisions actually made against those that need to be made
    - Are decisions challenged
  - Do the *right* people participate in jirga / shura process where higher level issues are concerned ?
  - Looking down from the district level-
    - Are decisions challenged/accountable/acted upon?
  - District assessments

Back Up

#50: Is there a correlation between perceptions of governance and support for the insurgency?

- Measures:
  - Reliance on alternative (Taliban) adjudication

- Means:
  - Polls
  - Surveys
  - Opinion groups
  - Coordination across commands/organizations

Governance
Corruption and Info Ops

- ▣ How does corruption affect and impact governance in Afghanistan?

- ▣ How does information operations affect and impact governance in Afghanistan?

- ▣ Make the important things measurable (not vice versa)

- What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

- What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

- What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

- What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

- How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

#17: What services do the insurgents provide that the Afghan government/ISAF have been unable to deliver?

- What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

- What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

- What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

- What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

- How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

#7: What is popular perception of effectiveness/intent of local/national governing officials?

- What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

- What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

- What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

- What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

- How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

#17: What services do the insurgents provide that the Afghan government/ISAF have been unable to deliver?

- Measures:
  - Underlying Taliban narrative (delivery of security & justice)
  - GIRoA ownership of resources
  - Failure of coalition to deliver expectations
  - Career path for aspiring mullah

- Means:
  - What does the populace believe?
    - How many have heard about Taliban justice?
  - Are Taliban decisions enforced?

- *Counter-shouter*

#20: How would the population design their local, district, provincial and national government if given the opportunity?

- What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

- What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

- What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

- What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

- How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

#39: What would be the accepted (active) role of the government in business development?

- What operational and analytical questions are we trying to answer?

- What are the key measures? What are the data requirements? What data are available and where does it come from? How are data assessed and who does the assessments?

- What tools are we using for analysis? What is the unit of analysis and what are its characteristics?

- What impediments to data collection and analysis? Who is collecting the data?

- How do we improve the state of data in Afghanistan? How are these data sources linked and integrated? What are the common activities and requirements that require data support?

Governance Terms of Reference
What is 'governance' ? (2)

- UN ESCAP: " *the **process** of decision-making and the **process** by which decisions are implemented (or not implemented"*

- The World Bank defines governance as
 *the **exercise of political authority** and the use of institutional resources to manage society's problems and affairs.*

- The Worldwide Governance Indicators project of the World Bank defines governance as
 *The **traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised**. This considers the process by which governments are selected, monitored and replaced; the capacity of the government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies and the respect of citizens and the state of the institutions that govern economic and social interactions among them.*

- An alternate definition sees governance as
 *the **use of institutions, structures of authority** and even collaboration to allocate resources and coordinate or control activity in society or the economy.*

- According to the United Nations Development Programme's Regional Project on Local Governance for Latin America:
 Governance has been defined as the ***rules of the political system*** to solve conflicts between actors and adopt decision (legality). It has also been used to describe the "proper functioning of institutions and their acceptance by the public" (legitimacy). And it has been used to invoke the efficacy of government and the achievement of consensus by democratic means (participation).